

International Refugee Law and Socio-Economic Rights

A range of emerging refugee claims is beginning to challenge the boundaries of the Refugee Convention regime and question traditional distinctions between 'economic migrants' and 'political refugees'. This book identifies the conceptual and analytical challenges presented by claims based on socioeconomic deprivation, and assesses the extent to which these challenges may be overcome by a creative interpretation of the Refugee Convention, consistent with correct principles of international treaty interpretation. The central argument is that, notwithstanding the dichotomy between 'economic migrants' and 'political refugees', the Refugee Convention is capable of accommodating a more complex analysis which recognizes that many claims based on socio-economic deprivation are indeed properly considered within its purview. This, the first book to consider these issues, will be of great interest to refugee law scholars, advocates, decision-makers and non-governmental organizations.

MICHELLE FOSTER is a Senior Lecturer and Director of the Research Programme in International Refugee Law at the Institute for International Law and the Humanities, University of Melbourne Law School.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN INTERNATIONAL AND COMPARATIVE LAW

Established in 1946, this series produces high quality scholarship in the fields of public and private international law and comparative law. Although these are distinct legal sub-disciplines, developments since 1946 confirm their interrelation.

Comparative law is increasingly used as a tool in the making of law at national, regional and international levels. Private international law is now often affected by international conventions, and the issues faced by classical conflicts rules are frequently dealt with by substantive harmonisation of law under international auspices. Mixed international arbitrations, especially those involving state economic activity, raise mixed questions of public and private international law, while in many fields (such as the protection of human rights and democratic standards, investment guarantees and international criminal law) international and national systems interact. National constitutional arrangements relating to 'foreign affairs', and to the implementation of international norms, are a focus of attention.

The Board welcomes works of a theoretical or interdisciplinary character, and those focusing on the new approaches to international or comparative law or conflicts of law. Studies of particular institutions or problems are equally welcome, as are translations of the best work published in other languages.

General Editors James Crawford SC FBA

Whewell Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, and Director, Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge

John S. Bell FBA

Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge

Editorial Board Professor Hilary Charlesworth Australian National University

Professor Lori Damrosch Columbia University Law School

Professor John Dugard Universiteit Leiden

Professor Mary-Ann Glendon Harvard Law School

Professor Christopher Greenwood London School of Economics

Professor David Johnston University of Edinburgh Professor Hein Kötz Max-Planck-Institut, Hamburg Professor Donald McRae University of Ottawa Professor Onuma Yasuaki University of Tokyo

Professor Reinhard Zimmermann Universität Regensburg

Advisory Committee Professor D. W. Bowett QC

Judge Rosalyn Higgins QC Professor J. A. Jolowicz QC

Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht CBE QC

Professor Kurt Lipstein Judge Stephen Schwebel

A list of books in the series can be found at the end of this volume.



International Refugee Law and Socio-Economic Rights

Refuge from Deprivation

Michelle Foster





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521870177

© Michelle Foster 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Foster, Michelle, 1972-

International refugee law and socio-economic rights : refuge from deprivation $\ /$ Michelle Foster.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in international and comparative law)

ISBN-13: 978-0-521-87017-7 (hardback)

ISBN-10: 0-521-87017-8 (hardback)

- 1. Refugees-Legal status, laws, etc. 2. Asylum, Right of. 3. Human rights.
- 4. Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees (1951) 5. Migrant labor—Legal status, laws, etc. I. Title. II. Series.

K3230.R45F67 2007

342.08′3–dc22 2006102051

ISBN-13 978-0-521-87017-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Acknowledgements	page ix
	Table of cases	xiii
	Table of treaties and other international instruments	xliii
	List of abbreviations	xlv
1	Introduction	1
	Background	2
	The key conceptual challenge: economic migrants	
	versus refugees	5
	Challenging the simplistic dichotomy	11
	Organization and methodology of analysis	21
2	A human rights framework for interpreting the	
	refugee convention	27
	Part one: the developing human rights framework	27
	Part two: justification of the human rights framework	36
	The need for a universal and objective standard	36
	Human rights as the standard: object and purpose	40
	The human rights approach confirmed by context	49
	Other rules of international law: promoting coherence	51
	Part three: possible objections to the human rights	
	approach	75
	Concerns about the legitimacy of the human rights	
	approach	75
	Concerns about the workability of the human rights	
	approach	85
	Conclusion	86

V



vi	CONTENTS	
3	Persecution and socio-economic deprivation	
	in refugee law	87
	Introduction	87
	Socio-economic rights and persecution: an overview	90
	Conceptual approaches to socio-economic rights and	
	persecution	111
	Problems and difficulties in the current approach	123
	Conclusion	154
4	Rethinking the conceptual approach to	
	socio-economic claims	156
	Introduction	156
	Part one: the current approach to persecution in light	
	of international human rights law	156
	The legitimacy of a normative hierarchy in human rights	157
	The merits of a categorical approach based on	
	state obligation	168
	The interdependence of human rights	181
	Conclusion on hierarchies and models in refugee law	190
	Part two: revisiting violations of socio-economic	
	rights and persecution	201
	The core obligations approach: general considerations	201
	Right to education and persecution	214
	Right to health and persecution	226
	Conclusion	235
5	Economic deprivation as the reason for being persecuted	236
	Introduction	236
	When is persecution for a Convention reason?	
	The particular challenge of socio-economic claims	237
	The desire for a 'better life': economic migrants	
	versus political refugees	238
	The causal connection to a refugee convention ground	247
	The meaning of the nexus clause: is intention required?	263
	Evidentiary issues: singling out versus group-based harm	286
	Conclusion	289
6	Economic disadvantage and the Refugee	
	Convention grounds	291
	Introduction	291



		CONTENTS	vii	
	Interpreting the social group ground: conceptual			
	approaches		292	
	Particular social groups		304	
	Economic class		304	
	Occupation		313	
	Disabled and ill persons		318	
	Women		324	
	Children		329	
	Conclusion		339	
7	Conclusions		341	
	Bibliography		356	
	Index		379	



Acknowledgements

This book is based largely on my doctoral thesis, undertaken for the SJD degree at the University of Michigan Law School, under the supervision of James C. Hathaway. It would not have been possible without the encouragement, stimulation and support of Jim Hathaway. His inspiring teaching during my LLM studies at Michigan enlivened my passion for refugee law, and his encouragement and belief that I could and should enroll in the SJD programme is the reason that this project was begun. In addition to providing a provocative 'sounding board' for my ideas, he also carefully read and commented upon various drafts of my dissertation chapters, and then continued to provide feedback as I undertook the task of revising the thesis for publication. This book has undoubtedly benefited from his careful scrutiny and I am indebted to him for his involvement with this project.

I was extremely fortunate to have a wonderful SJD committee comprising also Christine Chinkin and Brian Simpson. They each read and commented upon various drafts and provided sharp insight into and critique of many fundamental issues. They were both willing to listen to my ideas and problems and helped shape the organization of the book and strengthened important arguments. Pene Mathew read and provided very thoughtful and detailed comments on some early draft chapters. I also benefited greatly from numerous challenging conversations in respect of various aspects of my work with many people I met at the University of Michigan including Christine Breining-Kauffman, Rodger Haines, Rob Howse, Christopher McCrudden, Karen Musalo, Luis Peral, Catherine Phuong and Bruno Simma. In addition to talking with me on a number of occasions about my work, Rodger Haines also referred me to many helpful sources, and I am very grateful for his engagement with my project.

ix



X ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I also benefited from participation in the Community of Scholars programme run by the University of Michigan's Institute for Research on Women and Gender in May—June 2003, the University of California San Diego's CCIS summer programme on International Migration Studies in June 2003, and the LSA Graduate Workshop and Annual Conference in May 2004, all of which provided helpful feedback on my work, particularly from a multi-disciplinary perspective.

I owe a huge thanks to all the library staff at the University of Michigan Law Library, in particular Beatrice Tice and Sandy Zeff. In addition, I am extremely grateful for the assistance in tracking down difficult to obtain tribunal decisions from Michael Simperingham and Rodger Haines of the New Zealand RSAA, Nicole Robinson of the Australian RRT, Rebecca Cooper of the UK IAT, Mark Symes (barrister, UK), Stephen Knight and Karen Musalo of the Centre for Gender and Refugee Studies (USA) and Theresa Smith and Chantal Ippersiel of the Canadian Immigration and Review Board. I am also very grateful to Hugo Storey (of the UK IAT) and Les Mugridge and John Dean (of the UK Electronic Immigration Network) for arranging free access to the EIN's database of UK decisions, which proved essential to my research.

I am enormously appreciative of the generous financial assistance I received from the University of Michigan Law School over four years, both for the LLM and SJD degrees. In addition, I am very grateful for the constant support and encouragement of Dean Virginia Gordan throughout my residence at Michigan. I am also indebted to the Skye International Foundation, which primarily funded my LLM studies and thus allowed me to go to the USA in the first place.

The University of Melbourne Law School has also been very supportive of this project and I am extremely grateful to Michael Crommelin and Jenny Morgan for allowing me to take leave from teaching in order to work on this book, and for their general encouragement and support. I am also very grateful to Melbourne Law School for awarding me Research Support Funds in order to employ Luke Raffin — an undergraduate Melbourne student whose excellent work was crucial in finalizing the manuscript for publication.

I would not have been able to complete this book without the friendship of a number of people, many of whom suffered the trials and tribulations of the SJD process alongside me. The community of international students at Michigan became my family and I am especially grateful for the support of Patrick Blatter, Mona Dimalanta, Laura Huomo, Zdenek and Eva Kuhn, Sagit Leviner, Barbara Miltner,



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

vi

Louise Moor, Ivana Radicici, Carolyn Risk, Goran Selanec, Gitit Shriqui, Ninee Supornpaibul, Yofi Tirosh and Larissa Wakim. I was also extremely fortunate to have had the support of my friends from home, who, despite the considerable challenges presented by the distance from Australia, continued to provide support and love throughout my stay overseas, especially Rai Small and Tanya Segelov. In addition to her constant support, in particular Rai Small provided invaluable editing assistance when I needed it most.

I am, as always, grateful to my family for their constant love and encouragement, especially my mother and grandparents. Most importantly I am forever indebted to my partner Brad, who has been my best friend and most loyal and constant source of support during this challenging period. I will always be grateful for his wisdom, patience and belief in me.

Michelle Foster Melbourne, June 2006

The law is stated as at 31 December 2005, although later developments have been incorporated where possible.



Table of cases

I. International Decisions

International Court of Justice

Aegean Sea Continental Shelf Case (Greece v. Turkey) 1978 ICJ Rep 3. 62 Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide [1996] ICJ Rep 595. 47

Case Concerning the Gabcikovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia) [1997] ICJ Rep 7. 52, 60

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Advisory Opinion (I.C.J. July 9, 2004), 43 I.L.M. 1009 (2004) 177, 183

Maritime Delimitation and Territorial Questions between Qatar and Bahrain (Jurisdiction and Admissibility) [1995] ICJ Rep 6. 40

Namibia (Legal Consequences) Advisory Opinion (1971) ICJ Rep 31. 59 Reservations to the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide [1951] ICJ Rep 15. 47

Territorial Dispute (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Chad) [1994] ICJ Rep 6. 40

UN Human Rights Committee

ARJ v. Australia (Communication No. 692/1996, 11 August 1997) 353 Communication No. 458/1991: Cameroon 10/08/94, CCPR/C/51/D/458/1991. 185

F.H. Zwaan-de Vries v. the Netherlands (Communication No. 182/1984) U.N. Doc. hCCPR/C/29/D/182/1984 (16 April 1987). 186

L.G. Danning v. the Netherlands (Communication No. 180/1984), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/29/D180/1984 (16 April 1987). 185

xiii



XIV TABLE OF CASES

S.W.M. Broeks v. the Netherlands (Communication No. 172/1984), U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/29/D/172/1984 (16 April 1987). 185

World Trade Organization

Dispute Regarding United States - Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline, Appellate Body Report, adopted 20 May 1996 (WT/DS2/AB/R).

EC-Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products (29 September 2006) WT/DS291-293 (WTO Panel). 55

Japan — Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages, WTO Doc AB-1996-2 (1996) s. D (Report of the Appellate Body). 40

United States — Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products, WTO Doc. WT/DS58/AB/R (1998) (Report of the Appellate Body). 42, 76

II. Regional Decisions

African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

Decision Regarding Communication No. 155/96, African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights, ACHPR/COMM/A044/1, 27 May 2002. 174

European Court of Human Rights

Akdivar v. Turkey (1996) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 99/1995/605/693, 30 August 1996. 187

Aylor-Davis v. France Case No. 22742/93, 20 January 1994. 352

Berrehab v. The Netherlands (1988) 11 EHRR 322. 351

Bilgin v. Turkey (2000) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 23819/94,

16 November 2000. 187

Case of Airey v. Ireland (1979) Eur. Court HR, Application No. 6289/73, 9 October 1979. 187

Case of Bensaid v. United Kingdom (2001) 33 EHRR 10. 351

Case of Drozd and Janousek v. France and Spain Case No. 21/1991/273/344, 26 June 1992. 352

Chahal v. United Kingdom (1996) 23 EHRR 413. 348

Costello-Roberts v. United Kingdom (1993) 247-C Eur. Court HR (ser A). 76

Cyprus v. Turkey (2001) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 25781/94, 10 May 2001. 187



TABLE OF CASES

D v. the United Kingdom (1997), Eur. Court HR, Case No. 146/1996/767/964, 21 April 1997. 187, 188, 350

D v. United Kingdom, European Court of Human Rights, 42 BMLR 149, 2 May 1997. 21

Deumeland v. Germany (1986), Eur. Court HR, Case No. 9384/81, 29 May 1986. 187

Dulas v. Turkey (2001) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 25801/94, 3 January 2001. 187

Feldbrugge v. The Netherlands (1986) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 8562/79, 29 May 1986. 187

Gaygusuz v. Austria (1996) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 39/1995/545/631, 16 September 1996. 187

Golder v. United Kingdom (1975) Eur. Court HR (ser A); (1979) 1 EHRR 524.

Lopez Ostra v. Spain (1994) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 41/1993/436/515, 9 December 1994. 187

Mohamed Dougoz v. Greece Application No. 40907/98, 8 February 2000. 352

Pellegrini v. Italy Case No. 30882/96, 20 July 2001. 352

Salesi v. Italy (1993) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 11/1992/356/430, 26 February 1993. 187

Schuler-Zgraggen v. Switzerland (1993) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 17/1992/ 362/436, 24 June 1993. 187

Selçuk and Asker v. Turkey (1998) Eur. Court HR, Case No. 12/1997/796/ 998–9, 24 April 1998. 187

Sigurdur A Sijurjónsson v. Iceland, No. 24/1992/369/443, 24 June 1993. Soering Case Case No. 1/1989/161/217. 352

Inter-American Court on Human Rights

Advisory Opinion on the Interpretation of the American Declaration of Rights and Duties of Man within the Framework of Article 64 of the American Convention on Human Rights (1990) 29 ILM 379, 14 July 1989. 60

Other Treaties Subject to the Consultative Jurisdiction of the Court, Advisory Opinion No. OC-1/82, Inter-American Court of Human Rights, 24 September 1982, reprinted in (1982) 3 Human Rights Law Journal 140 42

The Effect of Reservations on the Entry into Force of the American Convention, Advisory Opinion No. OC-2/82 (Inter-American Court of Human



XVI TABLE OF CASES

Rights, 24 September 1982), reprinted in (1982) 3 Human Rights Law Journal 153 (1982). 42, 47

III. National Decisions

Australia

- A v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2002] FCA 238 (French, Lindgren and Stone JJ, 27 February 2002). 34
- Ahmadi v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 1070 (Wilcox J, 8 August 2001). 100
- Amanyar v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1995) 63 FCR 194.
- Appellant S395/2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2003) 216 CLR 473. 29
- Applicant A and Another v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs and Another (1996) 190 CLR 225. 37
- Applicant A v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1997) 142 ALR 331.
- Applicant in V488 of 2000 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 1815 (Unreported, Ryan J, 19 December 2001). 258
- Applicant S v. Minister for Immigration & Multicultural Affairs (2004) 217 CLR 387 298
- Applicant S61 of 2002 v. Refugee Review Tribunal [2003] FCA 1274 (Unreported, Lindgren J, 11 November 2003). 304
- Applicant S469 of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2004] FCA 64 (Unreported, Bennett J, 6 February 2004). 325
- Applicant VEAZ of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2003] FCA 1033 (Unreported, Gray J. 2 October 2003). 279
- Chan Yee Kin v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1989) 169 CLR 379. 224
- Chen Ru Mei v. Minister of Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1995) 130 ALR 405.
- Chen Shi Hai (an infant) by his next friend Chen Ren Bing v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [1998] 622 FCA (French J, 5 June 1998). 48
- Chen Shi Hai v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2000) 201 CLR 293. 45, 264
- Chokov v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [1999] FCA 823 (Unreported, Einfeld J, 25 June 1999). 256



TABLE OF CASES XVII

- Farajvand v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 795 (Allsop J, 20 June 2001). 34
- Gunaseelan v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1997) 49 ALD 594. 225
- Hagi-Mohamed v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 1156 (Wilcox, Weinberg and Hely JJ, 23 August 2001). 259
- Hapuarachchige v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1997) 46 ALD 496. 224
- Harirchi v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 1576 (Sackville, Kiefel and Hely JJ, 7 November 2001). 224
- IW v. City of Perth (1996) 191 CLR 1. 57
- Jahazi v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1995) 133 ALR 437.
- Ji Kil Soon v. Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs and the RRT (1994) 37 ALD 609. 100
- Kuthyar v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2000] FCA 110 (Einfeld J, 11 February 2000). 227, 321
- Li Shi Ping and Anor v. Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs (1995) 35 ALD 557. 98
- Liu v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2001) 113 FCR 541.
- Liu v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 257 (Cooper J, 16 March 2001). 85
- Lo v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1995) 61 FCR 221. 321 Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Abdi (1999) 162 ALR 105. 247
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Applicant S (2002) 124 FCR 256. 292
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Cali [2000] FCA 1026 (North J, 3 August 2000). 326
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Ibrahim (2000) 204 CLR 1. 59, 127
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Khawar (2002) 210 CLR 1. 29, 264
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Mohammed (2000) 98 FCR 405. 43
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Ndege [1999] FCA 783 (Weinberg J, 11 June 1999). 326
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Respondents S152/2003 (2004) 205 ALR 487. 29



XVIII TABLE OF CASES

- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Sarrazola (No. 2) (2001) 107 FCR 184. 28
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Savvin & Ors (2000) 98 FCR 168. 41
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Wang (2003) 215 CLR 518. 34
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs v. Zamora (1998) 84 FCR 458. 315
- Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs v. Kord [2002] FCA 334 (Heerey, Marshall and Dowsett JJ, 28 March 2002). 273
- Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs v. Che Guang Xiang (Federal Court of Australia, Jenkinson, Spender and Lee JJ, 12 August 1994). 105
- MMM v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1998) 90 FCR 324. 44
- Morato v. Minister of Immigration (1992) 39 FCR 401. 305
- NACM of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2003) 134 FCR 550. 29
- NACR of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration & Multicultural & Indigenous Affairs [2002] FCAFC 318 94
- NAGV and NAGW of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2005) 213 ALR 668. 46
- NASB v. Minister for Immigration & Multicultural & Indigenous Affairs [2003] FCA 1046 (Beaumont, Lindgren and Tamberlin JJ, 2 October 2003). 130
- NBFP v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2005] FCAFC 95 (Kiefel, Weinberg and Edmonds JJ, 31 May 2005). 130
- Nouredine v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1999) 91 FCR 138. 315
- Okere v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1998) 157 ALR 678. 271
- Prahastono v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1997) 77 FCR 260. 94
- Premalal v. Minister for Immigration, Local Government and Ethnic Affairs (1993) 41 FCR 117. 28–29
- Rajaratnam v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2000] FCA 1111 (Moore, Finn and Dowsett JJ, 10 August 2000). 253



TABLE OF CASES XIX

Ram v. Minister for Immigration (1995) 57 FCR 565. Re Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs, ex parte PT (2001) 178 ALR 497. 252 Reference N01/37224, RRT, 12 August 2002. 304 Reference N01/38085, RRT, 18 February 2002. Reference N01/38920, RRT, 11 July 2002. Reference N01/39111, RRT, 15 March 2002. Reference N01/39925, RRT, 18 April 2002. Reference N01/40604, RRT, 14 December 2001. Reference N02/42226, RRT, 30 June 2003. 246, 339 Reference N02/43084, RRT, 5 September 2002. Reference N02/43487, RRT, 29 September 2003. 233 Reference N02/43938, RRT, 1 July 2003. Reference N02/44244, RRT, 1 October 2003. Reference N03/45504, RRT, 1 July 2003. 227, 321, 322 Reference N03/45573, RRT, 24 February 2003. 282 Reference N03/45756, RRT, 28 January 2004. 303 Reference N03/46492, RRT, 24 July 2003. 225 Reference N03/46534, RRT, 17 July 2003. 192, 218, 219, 223, 226 Reference N03/46893, RRT, 5 December 2003. 225 Reference N03/47996, RRT, 10 February 2004. 219 Reference N93/02256, RRT, 20 May 1994. 119, 137 Reference N94/4731, RRT, 17 October 1994. 74 Reference N94/04178, RRT, 10 June 1994. 227, 321, 322 Reference N95/08165, RRT, 6 June 1997. 227 Reference N95/08624, RRT, 27 March 1997. 119, 125 Reference N96/11195, RRT, 10 September 1996. 73, 119, 137, 138, 139 Reference N97/13974, RRT, 10 July 1997. 144, 148 Reference N97/17592, RRT, 5 August 1997. Reference N97/19558, RRT, 22 April 1999. Reference N98/21471, RRT, 21 September 1998. 321 Reference N98/24000, RRT, 13 January 2000. 266 Reference V00/11003, RRT, 29 September 2003. 266 Reference V01/12621, RRT, 19 May 2002. Reference V01/12813, RRT, 1 December 2003. Reference V01/13062, RRT, 16 March 2004. Reference V01/13122, RRT, 19 August 2003. Reference V01/13868, RRT, 6 September 2002. 266

282

231, 321

Reference V02/14674, RRT, 13 February 2004.

Reference V5/03396, RRT, 29 November 1995.



XX TABLE OF CASES

Reference V93/01176, RRT, 26 August 1994. 28

Reference V94/01570, RRT, 28 February 1995. 37

Reference V94/02084, RRT, 23 February 1996. 228, 321

Reference V94/02820, RRT, 6 October 1995. 28, 98

Reference V95/03256, RRT, 9 October 1995. 210, 216, 228, 230, 321, 322

Reference V95/03786, RRT, 3 May 1996. 28

Reference V98/08951, RRT, 11 March 1999. 28

Reference V98/09164, RRT, 12 January 2001. 216, 220

Reference N98/22948, RRT, 20 November 2000. 312

Rocklea Spinning Mills Pty Ltd v. Anti-Dumping Authority (1995) 56 FCR 406.

Salem Subramaniam and Ors v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [1998] 483 FCA (Davies J, 4 May 1998). 304

Sarrazola v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (No. 3) [2000] FCA 919 (Madgwick J, 23 August 2000). 50

Sarrazola v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [1999] FCA 101 (Hely J, 17 February 1999). 324

SBAS v. Minister for Immigration & Multicultural Affairs [2003] FCA 528 (Cooper J, 30 May 2003). 104

SBBA v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2002] FCA 1401 (Mansfield J, 15 November 2002). 130

SCAT v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2002] FCA 962 (Von Doussa J, 6 August 2002). 130

SCAT v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2003) 76 ALD 625. 93

Seo v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2001] FCA 1258 (Spender J, 7 September 2001). 98

SGBB v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2003] FCA 709 (Selway J, 16 July 2003). 333

SGKB v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs & Indigenous Affairs (2004) 76 ALD 381. 98

Sithamparapillai v. Minister for Immigration & Multicultural Affairs [2000] FCA 897 (Goldberg J, 5 July 2000). 148

Subermani Gounder v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (1998) 87 FCR 1. 321

SZAFS v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2004] FCA 112 (Lindgren J, 20 February 2004). 327

SZBQJ v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2005] FCA 143 (Tamberlin J, 28 February 2005). 130

Thalary v. Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs (1997) 50 ALD 349. 98



TABLE OF CASES XXI

- Vam v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2002] FCAFC 125 (Black CJ, Drummond and Kenny JJ, 10 May 2002). 316
- VTAO v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (2005) 81 ALD 332. 105
- VTAO v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2004] FCA 927 (Merkel J, 19 July 2004). 130
- WAEW of 2002 v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs [2002] FCAFC 260 (Marshall, Weinberg and Jacobson JJ, 22 August 2002). 99
- WAKZ v. Minister for Immigration [2005] FCA 1965 (2 August 2005) 260 Wang v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs (2000) 105 FCR 548. 29, 279
- Waters v. Public Transport Corporation (1992) 173 CLR 349. 277
- Ye Hong v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [1998] 1356 FCA (Tamberlin J., 2 October 1998). 96
- Yousefi v. Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs [2000] FCA 1352 (Carr J, 22 September 2000). 144

Canada

- AFW (Re), No. V99-03532 [2001] CRDD No. 215, 12 October 2001. 244, 267, 331
- Ahmed v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship & Immigration) (2002) 7 Imm LR (3d) 286. 352
- Akhter v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2000] FCJ No. 1125. 208
- Ali v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1997] 1 FCD 26; 1996 FCD LEXIS 592. 103, 326
- ANK (Re), No. TA1-19010 [2002] CRDD No. 172, 26 August 2002. 308
- AWC (Re), No. AA1-01391 [2003] RPDD No. 71, 27 May 2003. 145
- B (TD) (Re), Nos. T91-01497, T91-01498 [1994] CRDD No. 391, 9 August 1994. 326, 331
- BNY (Re), Nos. TA1-03656, TA1-03657, TA1-03658 [2002] RPDD No. 223, 19 December 2002. 211, 218
- BOG (Re), No. VA0-03441 [2001] CRDD No. 121, 16 July 2001.
- Bougai v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1995] 3 FC D 32; 1995 FCTD LEXIS 211. 125



XXII TABLE OF CASES

- C(UY) (Re), Nos. T94-00416, T94-00418 and T94-00419 [1994] CRDD No. 389, 25 August 1994. 282
- Cabarcas v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, 2002 FCT 297, 19 March 2002. 258
- Cabello v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1995] FCJ No. 630. 100
- Canada (Attorney-General) v. Ward [1993] 2 SCR 689. 29, 77
- Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) v. Li [2001] FCJ No. 620. 331
- Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) v. Smith [1998] FCJ No. 1613; [1999] 1 FC 310. 336
- Chan v. Canada (Minister for Employment and Immigration) (1995) 128 DLR (4th) 213. 29
- Chan v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1993] 3 FC 675, 20 Imm. LR (2d) 181. 234
- Chan v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1995] 3 SCR 593.
- Chen v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1995] FCJ No. 189.
- Cheung v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1993] FCJ No. 309. 334
- CSE (Re), No. VA0-00566, [2001] CRDD No. 29, 9 March 2001. 326
- DJP (Re), No. T98-06446 [1999] CRDD No. 155, 3 August 1999. 267
- DUR (Re), No. U96-03325 [1996] CRDD No. 243, 16 December 1996. 211, 334
- EKD (Re), Nos. MA1-02054, MA1-02055, MA1-02056, [2001] CRDD No. 174, 21 December 2001. 334
- END (Re), No. VA1-01344 [2002] CRDD No. 22, 3 January 2002. 244
- ESO (Re), No. U96-04191 [1997] CRDD No. 27, 21 January 1997. 211, 334
- Flores v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), 2002 ACWSJ LEXIS 5953; 2002 ACWSJ 8570; 116 ACWS (3d) 420. 279
- F00 (Re), Nos. MA1-11675, MA1-11676, MA1-11677 [2003] CRDD No. 83, 16 June 2003. 337
- FOS (Re), Nos. TA0-01421, TA0-01422, TA0-01423, TA0-01424 [2001] CRDD No. 262, 16 May 2001. 239
- Freiberg v. Canada (Secretary of State) 78 FTR 283 (1994). 216
- FYM (Re), Nos. V97-00708, V97-00709, V97-00710, V97-00711 [1998] CRDD No. 153, 11 August 1998. 211, 337
- G (BB) (Re), Nos. T93-09636, T93-09638 and T93-09639 [1994] CRDD No. 307, 26 January 1994. 282



> xxiii TABLE OF CASES

- GAF (Re), No. V99-02929 [2000] CRDD No. 48, 21 February 2000. 272, 284,
- GCH (Re), Nos. T99-00524, T99-00525 [2000] CRDD No. 12, 12 January 2000. 226
- GIY (Re), No. T95-02172, [1996] CRDD No. 64, 25 July 1996.
- Gonzalez v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), 2002 ACWSI LEXIS 1317; 2002 ACWSJ 1921; 113 ACWS (3d) 126.
- GPE (Re), No. U96-02717, [1997] CRDD No. 215, 16 September 1997. GRF (Re), Nos. AA0-01454, AA0-01462 and AA0-01463 [2001] CRDD No. 88, 12 July 2001. 117, 133, 214
- GVP (Re), No. T98-06186 [1999] CRDD No. 298, 2 November 1999. 245, 268 HDO (Re), T98-17677 [1999] CRDD No. 116, 26 May 1999. Holloway [1983] 4 CHRR D/1454. 256
- HQT (Re), Nos. T96-03054 and T96-03055, [1997] CRDD No. 149, 8 July 1997. 125
- ICR (Re), Nos. V99-03509, V99-03511, V99-03532, V99-03536, V99-03540, V99-03544, V99-03547, V99-03548 [2000] CRDD No. 199, 14 February 2000.

244

- IPI (Re), No. A99-01121, [2000] CRDD No. 141, 29 August 2000. ITU (Re), Nos. T99-11540, T99-11541, [2001] CRDD No. 95, 31 May 2001. 336
- IVV (Re), No. TA2-00027 [2003] CRDD No. 64, 26 May 2003. J (RC) (Re), No. U93-04549, [1994] CRDD No. 265, 14 January 1994. 30 [D] (Re), No. A95-00633 [1998] CRDD No. 12, 28 January 1998. 203, 204,
- [LD (Re), No. T95-00305, [1996] CRDD No. 291, 9 April 1996. KBA (Re), Nos. T98-03163, T98-03164, T98-03165 [2001] CRDD No. 56, 7 May 2001. 206, 210
- KCS (Re), No. MA1-03477 [2002] CRDD No. 5, 16 January 2002. 213 KNA (Re), No. T97-05827 [1998] CRDD No. 148, 16 July 1998.
- KRQ (Re), Nos. T95-01828, T95-01829 [1996] CRDD No. 232, 1 October 1996. 208
- KWB (Re), Nos. A99-00789, A99-00790, A99-00791, A99-00792, A99-00793, [2002] CRDD No. 50, 8 April 2002.
- L (HX) (Re), Nos. T93-05935, T93-05936 [1993] CRDD No. 259, 31 December 1996. 282
- L (LL) (Re), Nos. A93-81751, A93-81752 and A93-81753 [1994] CRDD No. 368, 16 August 1994. 336
- L (YO) (Re), No. V93-02851, [1995] CRDD No. 50, 3 October 1995. Li v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1994] FCJ No. 1745. 95



XXIV TABLE OF CASES

- Li v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2000] FCJ No. 2037. 245
- Ling, Che Kueung v. Minister of Employment and Immigration (FCTD, Case No. 92-A-6555, Muldoon J, 20 May 1993). 191
- Litvinov v. Canada (Secretary of State) [1994] FCJ No. 1061. 327
- LXC (Re), No. TAO-05472, CRRD No. 96, 30 May 2001. 318
- Madelat v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1991] FCJ No. 49. 104
- Mare v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2001] FCJ No. 712. 152
- MCK (Re), No. U97-00412 [1997] CRDD No. 156, 2 July 1997. 211, 334
- MGG (Re), No. T99-10153 [2000] CRDD No. 191, 5 September 2000. 284
- Mirzabeglui v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1991] FCJ No. 50. 103
- MMS (Re), Nos. M95-02275, M95-02276, [1996] CRDD No. 162, 8 October 1996. 304
- MOQ (Re), No. VA2-03015, 6 August 2003. 337
- MYS (Re), Nos. V97-00156, V97-00962 [1998] CRDD No. 149, 23 July 1998. 330, 338
- MZJ (Re), No. V97-03500 [1999] CRDD No. 118, 31 May 1999. 331, 333
- NCM (Re), Nos. U94-04870, U94-04871, U94-04872 and U94-04873 [1996] CRDD No. 147, 19 July 1996. 336
- Nejad, Hossein Hamedi v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration, 1997 ACWSJ LEXIS 159001; 1997 ACWSJ 419632; 73 ACWS (3d) 1017. 275
- NWX (Re), No. T99-01434 [1999] CRDD No. 183, 25 August 1999. 267 O (QB) (Re), No. U93-04790 [1993] CRDD No. 283, 8 December 1993. 211, 334
- ODO (Re), Nos. VA1-03231, VA1-03232, VA1-03233 [2003] RPDD No. 66, 12 March 2003. 103, 216
- OGW (Re), No. MA1-08719 [2002] CRDD No. 53, 16 April 2002. 227, 229
- OPK (Re), No. U95-04575 [1996] CRDD No. 88, 24 May 1996. 232, 319
- OQU (Re), No. T98-09064 [1999] CRDD No. 157, 19 July 1999. 29
- ORL (Re), No. MAO-06253 [2001] CRDD No. 2, 18 January 2001. 313
- OXJ (Re), No. U96-03098 [1997] CRDD No. 224, 15 July 1997. 211, 334
- Oyarzo v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) [1982] 2 FC 779. 93. 224
- PEF (Re), No. VA0-00091 [2000] CRDD No. 110, 29 May 2000. 245, 337, 338
- *PFH (Re)*, Nos. T96-00266, T96-00267, T96-00269, [1997] CRDD No. 327, 3 February 1997. 96
- PKH (Re), No. T96-01209 [1996] CRDD No. 216, 17 December 1996. 149



TABLE OF CASES XXV

- *PKM (Re)*, No. V98-00452 [1998] CRDD No. 179, 11 September 1998. 211, 334
- Pushpanathan v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [1998] 1 SCR 982. 43
- PYM (Re), No. U98-01933 [1999] CRDD No. 163, 3 June 1999. 244
- QDS (Re), Nos. A99-00215, A99-00256, A99-00258 [1999] CRDD No. 235, 30 September 1999. 209, 212, 334, 336
- QJQ (Re), Nos. V97-01419, V97-01420, V97-01421, V98-02335, V98-02345, V98-02346 [1999] CRDD No. 189, 9 August 1999. 334
- QJV (Re), No. U97-01267 [1997] CRDD No. 249, 8 October 1997. 211, 334
- QQX (Re), No. T95-00479 [1996] CRDD No. 52, 5 July 1996. 210, 333
- QWY (Re), No. T98-07956 [1999] CRDD No. 271, 29 November 1999. 336
- R v. Sharpe, 2001 SCCDJ 42; 2001 SCCDJ LEXIS 2. 196
- Ramirez v. Canada (Solicitor General) [1994] FCJ No. 1888. 109
- RGC (Re), Nos. MA1-03752, MA1-03753 [2002] CRDD No. 23, 4 January 2002. 337
- RJR-MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General), 1995 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS
- RMK (Re), No. TA1-06365 [2002] CRDD No. 300, 16 May 2002. 126, 127 RRF (Re), No. T99-00210 [1999] CRDD No. 220, 21 September 1999. 210,
- S (ZD) (Re), No. T94-02002 [1995] CRDD No. 75, 20 June 1995. 263, 326 SBO (Re), Nos. VA1-02828, VA1-02826, VA1-02827, VA1-02829 [2003] RPDD No. 17, 27 February 2003. 218, 219, 221
- SCK (Re), No. MA1-00356, [2001] CRDD No. 401, 15 November 2001. 93
- SCP (Re), No. A95-00837, [1996] CRDD No. 244, 3 May 1996. 326
- Serrano v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), 1999 FTR LEXIS 745; 166 FTR 227. 324
- Shahiraj, 2001 Fed Ct Trial LEXIS 443; 2001 FCT 453. 258, 275, 279
- Shao Mei He v. Minister of Employment and Immigration [1994] FCJ No. 1243. 95, 100
- Sinora v. Minister of Employment and Immigration [1993] FCJ No. 725. 306
- SLH (Re), No. T95-07396 [1997] CRDD No. 121, 27 May 1997. 336
- SNJ, No. V99-03818 [2000] CRDD No. 119, 8 June 2000. 244
- STI (Re), No. T98-00366 [1999] CRDD No. 11, 18 January 1999. 211
- Sulaiman, Hussaine Hassan v. MCI (FCTD, Case No. IMM-525-94, Mackay J, 22 March 1996). 191
- Suresh v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) 2002 SCCDJ 8052. 63



XXVI TABLE OF CASES

- SWE (Re), Nos. T99-04041, T99-04042, T99-04043, T99-04044, T99-06333, T99-06363, T99-04047, T99-04048, T99-06334, [2000] CRDD No. 45, 1 March 2000. 87
- T (LR) (Re), No. V93-01037, [1994] CRDD No. 406, 29 March 1994. 312–13 TCV (Re), Nos. U95-00646, U95-00647 and U95-00648, [1997] CRDD No. 5, 15 January 1997. 336
- TEK (Re), No. V99-03528 [2000] CRDD No. 21, 27 January 2000. 244

 THK (Re), No. VA0-02635, [2001] CRDD No. 30, 22 March 2001. 330, 331

 TNL (Re), No. T95-07647, [1997] CRDD No. 251, 23 October 1997. 319
- TZU, No. TAO-03660 [2000] CRDD No. 249, 20 October 2000. 24-U (NX) (Re), Nos. T93-12579 and T93-12586 [1995] CRDD No. 74,
 - (NX) (Re), Nos. T93-12579 and T93-12586 [1995] CRDD No. 74, 25 July 1995. 208, 210
- UCR (Re), Nos. M99-07094, M99-07096 and M99-07098 [2001] CRDD No. 94, 31 May 2001. 337
- UKS (Re), No. T96-02313, [1997] CRDD No. 223, 9 May 1997. 307
- UKT (Re), No. T99-10465 [2000] CRDD No. 129, 12 July 2000. 211, 334
- United States of America v. Cotrobi [1989] 1 SCR 1469. 196
- UNN (Re), No. V95-00138, [1997] CRDD No. 12, 16 January 1997. 306
- UWB (Re), Nos. MA0-10528, MA0-10529 [2001] CRDD No. 212, 15 November 2001. 337
- *UZG (Re)*, Nos. T96-06291 and T96-06292, [1997] CRDD No. 209, 2 September 1997. 334
- V (HY) (Re), No. V91-00998, [1991] CRDD No. 746, 15 November 1991. 334
- V (OZ) Re, No. M93-04717, [1993] CRDD No. 164, 10 June 1993. 106
- VBJ (Re), No. T98-09801 [1999] CRDD No. 62, 30 April 1999. 211, 334
- WBT (Re), No. V98-00787, [1997] CRDD No. 119, 4 June 1999. 306
- WDK (Re), No. T96-04645 [1997] CRDD No. 187, 25 August 1997. 284 WMI (Re), Nos. T96-02166 and T96-02168 [1997] CRDD No. 113, 14 May
- WMI (Re), Nos. T96-02166 and T96-02168 [1997] CRDD No. 113, 14 May 1997. 208, 333
- WRH (Re), Nos. T97-05485, T97-05486, T97-05487, T97-05488, T97-05489, [1999] CRDD No. 112, 31 March 1999. 122
- Xiao v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2001] FCJ No. 349. 331
- Xie v. Canada [1994] FCJ No. 286. 95
- XUG (Re), No. TAO-02066 [2000] CRDD No. 248, 20 October 2000. 285
- Y (QH) Re, No. V93-02093 [1994] CRDD No. 203, 4 May 1994. 208
- YCK (Re), No. V95-02904 [1997] CRDD No. 261, 26 November 1997. 285, 306, 339
- YDJ (Re), Nos. V99-02955, V99-02956, V99-02953, V99-02914, V99-02933, V99-02912, V99-02951, V99-02913, V99-02960, V99-02927, V99-02931, V99-02960, V99-029



TABLE OF CASES XXVII

02919, V99-02928, V99-02949, V99-02923, V99-02961 [2000] CRDD No. 401, 9 May 2000. 244

YHI (Re), No. T95-07066, [1996] CRDD No. 65, 16 August 1996. 323 YSC (Re), Nos. T97-00096, T97-00097, T97-00098 [1998] CRDD No. 26, 22 January 1998. 219

ZAJ (Re), Nos. T96-04022, T96-04023, T96-04024, T96-04025, T96-04026 and T96-04027 [1997] CRDD No. 205, 15 September 1997. 217

Zheng v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2002] FCJ No. 580. 244

Zhu v. Canada (Minister for Citizenship and Immigration) [1994] FCJ No. 80.

Zhu v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration) [2001] FCJ No. 1251.

ZOI (Re), Nos. V99-02926, V99-02950, V99-02926, V99-02950 [2000] CRDD No. 91, 9 May 2000. 245, 338

ZWB (Re), Nos. T98-03011, T98-03012, T98-03013, T98-03014, T98-03015, T98-03016, T98-03017, T98-07280, T98-09201, T98-09202, T98-09203, [1999] CRDD No. 211, 27 September 1999. 117, 122

New Zealand

Butler v AG (1999) NZAR 205 62

DG v Refugee Status Appeals Authority (Unreported, High Court of New Zealand, Chisholm J, 5 June 2001). 31

H v. Chief Executive of the Department of Labour (Unreported, High Court of New Zealand, Case No. 183/00, 20 March 2001). 94, 191

K v Refugee Status Appeals Authority [2005] NZAR 441. 31

Qv. Refugee Status Appeals Authority [2001] NZAR 472. 191

Refugee Appeal No. 1/92, RSAA, 30 April 1992. 122

Refugee Appeal No. 3/91, RSAA, 20 October 1992. 294, 296, 305

Refugee Appeal No. 17/92, RSAA, 9 July 1992. 324

Refugee Appeal No. 24/91, RSAA, 9 June 1992. 305

Refugee Appeal No. 59/91, RSAA, 19 May 1992. 71

Refugee Appeal No. 61/92, RSAA, 22 July 1992. 314

Refugee Appeal No. 135/92, RSAA, 19 June 1993. 247

Refugee Appeal No. 547/92, RSAA, 2 June 1994. 324

Refugee Appeal No. 732/92, RSAA, 5 August 1994. 105, 122, 124, 137, 144

Refugee Appeal No. 1039/93, RSAA, 13 February 1995. 122, 132



XXVIII TABLE OF CASES

```
Refugee Appeal No. 1312/93, RSAA, 30 August 1995.
                                                    296, 297, 299
                                                     39, 93, 117, 118, 122,
Refugee Appeal No. 2039/93, RSAA, 12 February 1996.
    127, 191, 192
Refugee Appeal No. 2217/94, RSAA, 12 September 1996.
                                                        106, 107, 289
Refugee Appeal No. 70366/96, RSAA, 22 September 1997.
                                                         41
Refugee Appeal No. 70597/97, RSAA, 1 September 1997.
                                                        99
Refugee Appeal No. 70618/97, RSAA, 30 June 1998.
Refugee Appeal No. 70651/97, RSAA, 27 November 1997.
                                                        144
Refugee Appeal No. 70667/97, RSAA, 18 September 1997.
                                                         99
Refugee Appeal No. 70846/98, RSAA, 28 May 1998.
Refugee Appeal No. 70863/98, RSAA, 13 August 1998.
                                                     95, 97, 102
Refugee Appeal No. 71018/98, RSAA, 30 October 1998.
                                                      261
Refugee Appeal No. 71145/98, RSAA, 28 May 1999.
Refugee Appeal 71163/98, RSAA, 31 March 1999.
Refugee Appeal No. 71193/98, RSAA, 9 September 1999.
                                                        108, 242
Refugee Appeal No. 71336/99, RSAA, 4 May 2000.
                                                 109, 208, 289
Refugee Appeal No. 71404/99, RSAA, 29 October 1999.
                                                      94, 191
Refugee Appeal No. 71427/99, RSAA, 16 August 2000.
                                                      31, 39, 48, 77, 94,
    103, 108, 117, 118, 127, 136, 178, 190, 191, 192, 202, 269, 293, 296,
    325
Refugee Appeal No. 71509/99, RSAA, 20 January 2000.
                                                      304, 305
Refugee Appeal No. 71605/99, RSAA, 16 December 1999.
                                                        99, 105, 124, 125,
    260
Refugee Appeal No. 71606/99, RSAA, 31 March 2000.
                                                    117
Refugee Appeal No. 72024/2000, RSAA, 13 July 2000.
Refugee Appeal Nos. 72179/2000, 72180/2000, 72181/2000, RSAA,
    31 August 2000.
                       310
Refugee Appeal No. 72189/2000, RSAA, 17 August 2000.
                                                       310
Refugee Appeal Nos. 72558/01 and 72559/01, RSAA, 19 November 2002.
                                                                      31,
    68, 82, 86, 147, 191
Refugee Appeal No. 72635/01, RSAA, 6 September 2002.
                                                       256, 258, 259, 274,
    275
Refugee Appeal No. 72668/01, RSAA, 5 April 2002.
                                                  31, 41
Refugee Appeal No. 73361/02, RSAA, 19 June 2003.
                                                  259
Refugee Appeal No. 73378, RSAA, 11 December 2003.
                                                     272
Refugee Appeal No. 73607, RSAA, 26 February 2004.
                                                    134
Refugee Appeal No. 73952, RSAA, 26 May 2005.
Refugee Appeal No. 74395, RSAA, 21 January 2004.
                                                   106
Refugee Appeal No. 74665/03, RSAA, 22 July 2003.
```



TABLE OF CASES XXIX

Refugee Appeal No. 74665/03, RSAA, 7 July 2004. 25, 31, 37, 39, 40, 41, 48, 54, 68, 81, 82, 117, 118, 122, 274

Refugee Appeals Nos. 74754, 74755, RSAA, 7 January 2004. 118, 137 Refugee Appeal No. 74880, RSAA, 29 September 2005. 107, 292 Refugee Appeal No. 75221, 23 September 2005 84 Refugee Appeal 75233, 1 February 2005. 326

South Africa

Minister of Health v. Treatment Action Campaign (2002) (5) SA 721 (CC). 230

Minister of Home Affairs and Ors v. Watchenuka and Anor, 2004 (2) BCLR 120 (SCA) at 127. 102

National Coalition for Gay and Lesbian Equality and Anor v. Minister of Justice and Others (1998) (12) BCLR 1517 (CC), 1998 SACLR LEXIS 26, 9 October 1998. 182

Phillips and Anor v. Director of Public Prosecutions (Witwatersrand Local Division) and Others (2003) (4) BCLR 357 (CC). 200

Refugee Appeal Board, Appeal No. 53/2005, 30 November 2004. 102 S v. Makwanyane and Anor (1995) (6) BCLR 665 (CC). 196 Van der Walt v. Metcash Trading Limited (2002) (5) BCLR 454 (CC). 200

United Kindgom

Adan v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [1997] 2 All ER 723.

Amare v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2005] All ER (D) 300. 29, 79, 191

Ameen v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 07246. 259 Bukasa v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/60692/96, 24 June 1997). 243

Demirkaya v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [1999] Imm AR 498. 25

Devaseelan v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] IAT 702. 352 Doymus v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/80112/99, 19 July 2000). 30



XXX TABLE OF CASES

El Deaibes v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 02582.

Ferdowsa Ismail Beldeq [2002] UKIAT 06753. 305

Filiusina v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/65188/2000, CC/13395/2000, 3 December 2001). 146 *G (Somalia)* [2003] UKIAT 00011. 206

Gashi and Nikshiqi v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [1997] INLR 96. 29

Gjoni v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 06307. 270Glowacka v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. 18928, 9 July 1999). 214

Grahovac (Unreported, IAT, Case No. 11761, 9 January 1995). 93 Grecu (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/64793/96, 8 January 1998). 100, 146

Gudja (Unreported, IAT, CC/59626/97, 5 August 1999). 105 He v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] EWCA 1150, [2002] Imm AR 590. 94

Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000] 3 All ER 577. 29 Horvath v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000] Imm AR 205. 37 HS [2005] UKIAT 00120. 116

Islam and Others v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, Asylum and Immigration Tribunal, 2 October 1996). 39

Jain v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000] Imm AR 76. 69

Jain v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2000] Imm AR 76. 69.

Jakitay v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT,

Appeal No. 12658, 15 November 1995). 207, 330

James v. Eastleigh Borough Council [1990] 2 AC 751. 277

Judgment of K [2003] UKIAT 00023, 7 July 2003. 269

Kagema v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [1997] Imm AR 137. 139

Karickova v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 05813. 116

Koffi v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. 18227, HX/60314/96, 17 September 1999). 146

Korca v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX-360001-2001, 29 May 2002). 189

Kovac (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. CC3034497, 28 April 2000). 292 Krayem v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2003] EWCA Civ. 649.

Latheef v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, 7 March 2002). 207



TABLE OF CASES XXXI

- Macura, Ljiljana, Maletic v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX-61441-00, 11 September 2001). 116, 122, 134
- Majkic v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. CC/12867/01, 10 December 2001). 134
- Maksimovic v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Case No. 01TH00432, 16 May 2001). 272
- Maksimovic v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2004] EWHC 1026. 93, 105
- Mandali v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX16991-02, 27 March 2003). 188
- Mandali v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 0741. 351
- Matthews v. Ministry of Defence [2003] All ER (D) 173.
- Mohamad v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/74489/94, 21 October 1996). 241
- Mohamud Osman Amin v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 04084. 262
- Montoya v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] EWCA Civ. 620. 277, 305
- Montoya v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] INLR 399. 296 Moro v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2001] EWCA Civ. 1680. 97
- Moro v. The Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX-72022-98, 11 September 2000). 97
- NS Afghanistan CG [2004] UKIAT 00328, 30 December 2004 328
- Ogbeide v. Secretary of State for the Home Department (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX/08391/2002, 10 May 2002). 285, 307
- Omoruyi v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2001] Imm AR 175. 271
- Paul Owen v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2002] UKIAT 03285. 188
- Peco (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. HX-74935-94, 12 November 1996). 106, 116, 241, 292
- Popik (Unreported, IAT, Case No. HX/70116/98, 20 May 1999). 223 Puzova v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2001] UKAIT 00001.
- Quijano v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [1997] Imm AR 227. 300
- R (on the application of Adan) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2001] 2 AC 477. 36



XXXII TABLE OF CASES

- R (on the Application of Altin Vallaj) v. Special Adjudicator [2001] INLR 455. 21, 63
- R (on the application of C) v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal [2003] EQHC 883 (Admin), 9 April 2003. 270
- R (on the application of Hoxha) v. Special Adjudicator [2005] 4 All ER 580. 43
- R (on the application of Okere) v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal (Queen's Bench Division, Administrative Court, Scott Baker J, CO/5067/1999, 9 November 2000). 117
- R (on the application of Razgar) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2004] All ER (D) 169. 351
- R (on the Application of Secretary of State for the Home Department) v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal (Queen's Bench Division (Administrative Court), CO/593/1999, 21 November 2000), at para. 26. 101, 135
- R (on the application of Sivakumar) v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2003] 2 All ER 1097. 258
- R (on the application of Ullah) v. Special Adjudicator; Do v. Secretary of State for the Home Department [2004] 3 All ER 785. 29, 352
- R (on the application of Vuckovic) v. Special Adjudicator and anor (Queens's Bench Division (Administrative Court), CO/3021/2000, 18 December 2000). 242
- R v. Home Secretary, ex parte Sivakumaran [1988] AC 958, [1988] 1 All ER
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Daniel Boahin Jonah [1985] Imm AR 7. 30
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte De Melo and De Araujo [1997] Imm AR 43. 324
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Bolanus [1999] Imm AR 350. 324
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte De Melo and Anor (Unreported, IAT, Appeal No. CO/1866/96, 19 July 1996). 277
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal, ex parte Sandralingham and Another; R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Another, ex parte Rajendrakumar [1996] Imm AR 97. 29
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department; ex parte Shah (Queen's Bench Division, CO 4330/95, 12 November 1996). 301, 354
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Syeda Khatoon Shah [1997] Imm AR 148. 21
- R v. Immigration Appeal Tribunal and Another, ex parte Shah [1998] 4 All ER 30. 36