

**Edvard Grieg's Influence on American Music:
The Case of the Piano Concertos in A-Minor from the Pen of
Edvard Grieg and Edward MacDowell**

Ohran Noh
(University of Saskatchewan, Canada)

In his book entitled *Grieg and His Music*, Henry T. Finck prefaces his deliberation with a poignant dedication to Edward MacDowell, “America’s most original composer [...] who was more influenced by Edvard Grieg than by any other master and whose last intellectual pleasure was the reading of the story of Grieg’s life in the first edition of this book.”¹ Regarding the geographical distance between Norway and the United States of America, the close artistic friendship between Edvard Grieg (1843-1907) and Edward MacDowell (1860-1908) seems curious and unlikely, especially considering that the two composers never met in person even once in their lives, making their unique relationship both musically and personally valuable to examine. Similarly, both composers achieved their peak fame during their lifetimes and are recognised as the most representative composers of their respective countries even today. Having common Scottish ancestral roots, Grieg and MacDowell were mutual admirers of each other with evidence that can be traced through their active correspondence. In Finck’s book, some of the quotes are provided to describe the relationship between Grieg and MacDowell:

... In many ways Edvard Grieg reminded us of *our* Edward [MacDowell]. Like him, he has his little work cabin away from the house, down a steep path, and among the trees in the garden. Some manuscripts were lying on the table, ... Both the Griegs had many questions to ask about America and Americans, especially the MacDowells, to whom they sent the kindest messages...²

¹ Henry T. Finck, *Grieg and His Music*. (New York: John Lane, 1909).

One of the “kindest messages” Grieg sent was during a time when MacDowell became so ill that he started to show the signs of deterioration physically and intellectually:

The news of MacDowell’s serious illness has deeply affected me...his qualities as a man are as remarkable as his qualities as an artist. He is a complete Personality, with an unusually sympathetic and sensitive nervous system. Such a temperament gives one the capacity not only for moods of the highest transport, but for a unspeakable sorrow tenfold more profound. This is the unsolvable riddle. An artist so ideally endowed as MacDowell must ask himself: why have I received from nature this delicately strung lyre, if I were better off without it? ... every artist must ask himself this question.... *But*: the artist is an optimist. Otherwise he would be no artist. He believes in the triumph of the good and the beautiful. He trusts in his lucky star till his last breath. And you, the wife of a highly gifted artist, will not and must not lose hope! In similar cases, happily, one often witnesses a seemingly inexplicable recovery. If it can give MacDowell a moment’s cheer, say to him that he has in distant Norway a warm and understanding friend who feels for him, and wishes from his heart that for him, as for you, better times may soon come.³

Finck also adds a quote concerning MacDowell’s esteem for Grieg in a footnote of his book:

...MacDowell simply worshipped Grieg, to whom he dedicated two of his sonatas. “His music is like a glass of fresh water in a desert,” he once said to a pupil...⁴

Besides this simple common biographical information, they both composed a piano concerto in the same key, a minor, which bonds them closely together compositionally as well. Their piano concerti are important not only for their shared key but for their acknowledgement of each other: the third movement of MacDowell’s

² Finck, *Grieg and His Music*, pp. 77-78.

³ Lawrence Gilman, *Edward MacDowell* (New York: John Lane Co., 1908), pp.73-74.

⁴ Finck, *Grieg and His Music*, p. 137.

Piano Concerto in A-Minor, No. 1, Op. 15, in particular, borrows from the dramatic opening of Grieg's sole piano concerto. Moreover, MacDowell's dedication of several pieces, such as the *Keltic Sonata*, Op. 59, to Grieg supports his special admiration for this Northern European master. However, with regard to musical stylistic issues in MacDowell's composition, there have been few exclusive studies concerning Grieg's influence on MacDowell's music. European Romanticism, particularly the Germanic variety acquired during Grieg's student years, and later nationalistic folk idioms are important, influential musical elements in Grieg's *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*. Some of these same influences are also represented in the final movement of MacDowell's first piano concerto. Grieg's important inspiration to this American composer will be the focal point of this comparative approach, which focuses on a detailed examination of the traditional parameters to provide a common basis for the consideration of related compositional practices and philosophical issues explored in both pieces. With this aim in mind, this paper will fill an important lacuna in Grieg's reception in North America, a topic that has received relatively little attention in the past.

For MacDowell, the *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, No.1, Op.15 was one of his most famous pieces among the works he composed in his early years. Born as the third son of Thomas and Frances Knapp MacDowell in New York City, MacDowell started his piano lessons at age eight. After his parents sent him to the *Paris Conservatoire* in France for his further studies in 1876, MacDowell's dissatisfaction with the instruction there started to grow. He found the teaching methods in general at the French *Conservatoire* pedantic, shallow, and very restrictive.⁵ His frustration finally let him to find a new venue for his professional music studies. In 1879, MacDowell moved to study at the Frankfurt Conservatory, and he remained in Germany for the next decade in order to continue his musical career. In Frankfurt, MacDowell obtained an

opportunity to study the piano with Carl Heymann (1854-1922), who was a recently appointed piano professor, and orchestration with the composer Joachim Raff (1822-1882). Both teachers encouraged MacDowell to compose as well as to play upon his talents, and at age 22 in 1882, MacDowell completed the orchestral score of his first piano concerto after he took a copy of the concerto in two-piano form to Franz Liszt (1811-1886), to whom the composition was dedicated, in the fall of 1881. Ultimately, this important meeting, along with several engagements with the German publishers during his German years, turned MacDowell's focus to composition.⁶

Edvard Grieg was born in Bergen as the fourth child of John and Gesine Grieg and he began piano lessons at the age of six with his mother. In the summer of 1858, Ole Bull (1810-1880)⁷, a Norwegian violinist and composer who was close to Grieg's family, suggested to John and Gesine to send Edvard to the Leipzig Conservatory for more advanced musical studies. There he studied with E. F. Wenzel, a close friend of Robert Schumann, and Grieg became intimately familiar with early Romantic music, especially Schumann's German Romanticism⁸ that stayed with him for the rest of his life. Interestingly enough, Schumann (1810-1856) also composed a piano concerto in the key of A-Minor⁹, which in fact was the model for Grieg's own composition of the *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*.¹⁰ Grieg composed his concerto in 1868,

⁵ *The Music Student*, vol. 7, no.12 (August 1915), p. 240.

⁶ For further information on MacDowell's biography, see Dolores Pesce, *et al.*, "MacDowell [McDowell], Edward (Alexander)," in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol.15, pp. 458-465.

⁷ John Bergsagel, "Bull, Ole (Bornemann)," in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol. 4, pp.592-595.

⁸ Dennis F. Mahoney, ed., *The Literature of German Romanticism*. (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2004). Also see, John Daverio, *Nineteenth-Century Music and the German Romantic Ideology*. (New York: Schirmer Books, c1993).

⁹ Claudia Macdonald, *Robert Schumann and the Piano Concerto*. (New York and London: Routledge, 2005).

¹⁰ David Monrad-Johansen, *Edvard Grieg*. trans. by Madge Robertson (New York: Tudor, 1945, c1938); Also see, Finn Benestad and Dag Schjelderup-Ebbe, *Edvard Grieg: The Man and The Artist*. trans. by William H. Halverson and Leland B. Sateren (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, c1988).

just as MacDowell started his piano lessons as an eight-year old boy. In contrast to Schumann, Grieg developed his opening movement beyond merely imitating Schumann and started to show his own original musical ideas. As a result, the pieces do not exactly resemble each other, but it is reasonable to say that Grieg chose Schumann's concerto as a model of the sonata form during his formative years as a composer.¹¹

Despite the originality of the concertos by both composers, it is still interesting to compare their first movements in terms of their formal schemes, which Grieg was trying to learn from this German master. Grieg follows the overall form of Schumann's first movement but differentiates his concerto by employing his own musical ideas. Later, Grieg's exercise in Schumann's adaptation of the sonata form then disseminated to MacDowell's music writing but the art of creating one's own musical language applies to this young American composer just as it did to Grieg. In Schumann's and Grieg's first movement of their concertos, the opening passages for the soloist are analogous. In both, the introduction is displayed by the piano solo as the descending chordal passages from the high to the middle register in their *fortissimo*. Here, Grieg diverges from Schumann's example by using the timpani, whose job is to roll from *pianissimo* and *crescendo* as a pathway for the vigorous appearance of the solo piano. Example 1-(a) and 1-(b) show Schumann's and Grieg's openings for the first movements of their piano concertos.

[I.] Allegro affettuoso $\text{♩} = 84$

The image displays a page of a musical score for Robert Schumann's Piano Concerto No. 1, first movement. The score is arranged in a standard orchestral format with multiple staves. The instruments listed on the left are: Flauto (Flute), Oboe, Clarinetto (A) (Clarinet in A), Fagotto (Bassoon), Corno (C) (Horn in C), Tromba (C) (Trumpet in C), Timpani (c/A) (Timpani), Pianoforte (Piano), Violino I and II (Violins), Viola, Violoncello (Cello), and Contrabasso (Double Bass). The score begins with a forte (f) dynamic and a tempo marking of Allegro affettuoso with a quarter note equal to 84 beats per minute. The piano part features a prominent solo section with complex chordal textures and arpeggiated figures. The woodwinds and strings provide harmonic support, with the strings playing a steady, rhythmic accompaniment.

¹¹ Gerald Abraham, "The Piano Concerto," in: *Music of the Masters Series, Grieg: A Symposium*, ed. by

[Tutti]

Fl. 1 $\frac{4}{2}$ *f*

Ob. 1 $\frac{4}{2}$ *fp* *espressivo* *sf*

Clar. (A) $\frac{4}{2}$ *fp* *sf*

Fg. 1 $\frac{4}{2}$ *fp* *sf*

Cor. (C) $\frac{4}{2}$ *fp* *sf*

Tr. (C) $\frac{4}{2}$ *f*

Timp. (e/A) *f*

PI. *sf*

I VI. *f*

II VI. *f*

Va. *f*

Vc. *f*

Cb. *f*

9

Fl. 1 2

Ob. 1 2

Clar. (A) 1 2

Fg. 1 2

Cor. (C) 1 2

Pf.

Solo

p espressivo

f

I

VI.

II

Va.

Vc.

Cb.

p

pizz.

p

pizz.

p

15

Pf.

p

sul G. . . .

p

I

VI.

II

Example 1- (a)

Robert Schumann, Piano Concerto in A minor, First Movement, mm. 1-19

Allegro molto moderato ♩ = 84

Opus 16

Flauti

Oboi

Clarineti in A

Fagotti

I II
Corni in E

III IV

Trombe in C

I II
Tromboni

III

Timpani in A E

pp molto fz

Allegro molto moderato ♩ = 84

Pianoforte

pp

poco rit.

a tempo

stringenti

a tempo

fz

sed.

** sed. **

** sed. **

** sed. **

** sed. **

I
Violini

II

Viola

Violoncello

Basso

pizz.

pizz.

pizz.

pizz.

pizz.

7

Fl. *p dolce*

Ob. *p dolce*

Clar.in A *p dolce*

Fag. *p dolce*

Cor.in E I. Solo *p*

I. VI. *arco p pp*

II. VI. *arco p pp*

Vla. *arco p pp*

Vcello *arco p pp*

B. *arco p pp*

14

Fl. *p* *cresc.* *f*

Ob. *p* *cresc.* *f*

Clar.in A *p* *cresc.* *f*

Fag. *p* *cresc.* *f*

I. Cor.in E *mp* *cresc.* *f*

II. Cor.in E *mp* *cresc.* *f*

I. VI. *div. p* *cresc.* *f*

II. VI. *p* *cresc.* *f*

Vla. *p* *cresc.* *f*

Vcello *p* *cresc.* *f*

B. *p* *cresc.* *f*

18 A

Fl. *p*

Ob. *p*

Fag. *p*

Pfte. *mp* *cantabile*

I. Vl. *p* *pp*

II. Vl. *p* *pp*

Vla. *p* *pp*

Vcllo. *p* *pp*

B. *p* *pp* A

24 *fz* *3* *poco ritard.* *dim.*

Pfte.

27 *a tempo* *cresc.*

Pfte.

I. Vl. *p* *cresc.* *pp*

II. Vl. *p* *cresc.* *pp*

Vla. *p* *cresc.* *pp*

Vcllo. *p* *cresc.* *pp*

B. *pizz.* *cresc.* *pp* *arco* *pp*

Example 1-(b)

Edvard Grieg, Piano Concerto in A minor, Op.16, First Movement, mm. 1-30

Grieg's distinctive use of the timpani in the introduction also plays a crucial role in MacDowell's opening of the third movement in his A-Minor Concerto; before the notable piano solo part in both concertos, it is difficult to distinguish the two movements solely by listening to the timpani effect only.

In the first movements of Schumann and Grieg, the winds state the main theme, which is followed by the soloist who repeats it. The second theme in both concertos moves smoothly from the home key in A-Minor to its relative major, C-Major, although Grieg again departs from Schumann, who introduces a new theme in a different musical gesture using accents or sudden *fortissimo* (*sforzando*) to animate the overall musical mood while featuring the staccato or octaves for the robust figures over arpeggiation by the solo throughout almost the entire section. On the other hand, Grieg presents a second theme that is not too foreign compared to the first in terms of musical mood. His second theme is displayed in *dolce, piu tranquillo*, through which Grieg maintains the melodic and lyrical musical lines instead of Schumann's *animato* theme. Both expositions conclude with an *animato* and both developments commonly outline two main sections, the first of which contains fragments of the main theme performed by woodwind soli over the arpeggiated lines of the piano. Then, in the second section of the developments, the piano solo carries the melody more dominantly. While Schumann separates the two sections in his development by a short passage by both solo and the *tutti* in a dialogue format, Grieg smoothes out the whole development section naturally without adding any other extra passages. After the memorable cadenza sections in the two concertos, both composers add a coda section which moves more quickly than the rest of the movement. Here again, Grieg experiments with a different approach by introducing an entirely new theme while Schumann uses the motto-theme variation for

the coda. Table 1 shows the overall formal schemes and their musical features of the first movement of both concertos.

Like Grieg, MacDowell also had a definite connection with Schumann's music and life from his years at the Frankfurt Conservatory in Germany where Clara Schumann, widow of Robert Schumann, was one of the faculty members. Schumann and MacDowell often compare in their commonalities, such as their strong attachment to literature, to nature and to the musical philosophy they shared.¹² Although MacDowell's *Piano Concerto in A-Minor* is usually weighed against Grieg's concerto for its famous opening with the timpani, the influence of German Romanticism, especially from Schumann, on MacDowell's work should be also noted in considering the lineage of these three composers — Robert Schumann, Edvard Grieg, and Edward MacDowell — which is not a coincidence but shows deliberate impact on each other.

For Grieg, the Germanic influence served as a point of departure for his ultimate musical styles, and his artistic life entered a new phase in which he started to adopt Norwegian folk music into his artistry. Grieg's interest in national folk music was not sudden but started in his early youth through his acquaintance with Ole Bull, who was in fact the first major Norwegian musician to incorporate national romanticism¹³ into classical musical scenes. In 1865, Grieg was introduced to Rikard Nordraak (1842-1866),¹⁴ another influential Norwegian composer in Grieg's life, in Copenhagen and this meeting further enhanced Grieg's involvement with folk music. His newly awakened Norwegian nationalism became more apparent in the first set of *Lyric Pieces for Piano*, Op.12, composed at the end of 1867. He gave symbolic titles such as *Norsk* (no.6),

¹² Alan H. Levy, *Edward MacDowell: An American Master*. (Maryland, Lanham: Scarecrow Press, 1998), p. 35.

¹³ Roy Porter and Mikuláš Teich, ed., *Romanticism in National Context*. (Cambridge; New York, Cambridge University Press, 1988).

¹⁴ Kari Michelsen, "Nordraak [Nordraach], Rikard," in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol.18, pp. 37-38.

Table 1
Overall Formal Schemes of the First Movement of Two Concertos
by Schumann and Grieg

Robert Schumann		<i>Piano Concerto in A-Minor, Op. 54</i>
Exposition		
Introduction	m. 1	<i>Allegro affettuoso</i> by tutti but mainly by piano solo
Theme 1	m. 4	<i>Espress.</i> by winds
Theme 1	m. 12	<i>Espressivo</i> by piano solo
Theme 2	m. 67	<i>Animato, espressivo</i>
Development		
	m. 156	<i>Andante espressivo</i>
	m. 185	Tempo I (<i>Allegro</i>)
	m. 205	<i>Passionato</i>
Recapitulation		
Theme 1	m. 259	<i>Espress.</i> by winds
Theme 1	m. 267	<i>Espress.</i> by piano solo
Theme 2	m. 320	<i>Animato</i>
Cadenza	m. 402	<i>espressivo</i>
	m. 434	<i>Un poco andante</i>
Coda	m. 458	<i>Allegro molto</i>

Edvard Grieg		<i>Concerto for Piano and Orchestra in A-Minor, Op.16</i>
Exposition		
Introduction	m. 1	<i>Allegro molto moderato</i> by tutti by piano solo
	m. 2	
Theme 1	m. 7	by winds
	m. 23	<i>Cantabile</i>
Theme 1	m. 19	by piano solo
	m. 31	<i>Animato</i>
	m. 43	<i>Cantabile</i>
Theme 2	m. 49	<i>Piu tranquillo</i> (<i>Tempo lento</i>)
	m. 53	<i>Tranquillo e cantabile</i>
	m. 61	<i>Piu animato</i>
Development		
	m. 89	<i>Molto tranquillo</i>
Recapitulation		
Theme 1	m. 117	by piano solo
	m. 121	<i>Cantabile</i>
	m. 129	<i>Animato</i>
Theme 2	m. 147	<i>Piu Tranquillo</i>
	m. 151	<i>Tranquillo e cantabile</i>
	m. 155	<i>Animato</i>
	m. 159	<i>Sempre piu animato</i>
Cadenza	m. 176	<i>Adagio</i>
	m. 177	<i>Presto</i>
	m. 179	<i>Lento</i>
	m. 180	Tempo I
Coda	m. 214	<i>Poco piu allegro</i>

Folkevis (no.5), and *Faedrelandssang* (no.8) to some of the pieces in the set. About one half year later in June 1868, Grieg completed his *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, Op.16 at Søllerød, Denmark during a family trip in the milder and warmer climate there.¹⁵ Thus, Grieg's piano concerto is not far removed from the beginning of his involvement with folk musical sources, through which he eventually became one of the leading composers of Norwegian nationalism¹⁶ in its Golden Age of the Romantic era. Above all, although more drastic development occurred in his numerous later works such as his folksong arrangements, his association with folk music already had its effect on his harmonic imagination with the completion of *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, Op.16. Grieg's harmonic language involves rich chromaticism and use of long pedal point in association with rhythmic or melodic folk elements which are generally defined by minor or modal scales, sometimes mixed with major scales, to create a sober and haunting sound.¹⁷

In the context of nationalism, MacDowell is also considered one of the first and most influential composers in America. Along with the trend of the musical nationalism, MacDowell also developed his own philosophy about the musical scene in America. Trained in Europe, MacDowell understood the differences in musical culture between America and parts of Europe during the period. For example, he said, "the Devil does ... Clavier work in places like Boston. Here [in Paris] he leads a full orchestra with special loud brass" when he visited Paris, France in 1895.¹⁸ MacDowell basically disdained the popular notion of "American music" that surged across his country. At that time, the American musical scene in various genres was strongly attached to the high culture of Europe and particularly to Germanic culture; it was common to have American orchestras with primarily Germanic repertoires or a German conductor. MacDowell saw this sort of

¹⁵ Finck, *Grieg and His Music*. (New York: John Lane, 1909), p. 44.

¹⁶ Oscar J. Falnes, *National Romanticism in Norway*. (New York: AMS Press, 1968).

¹⁷John Horton, *et al.*, "Grieg, Edvard (Hagerup)," in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol. 10, pp.396-410.

Americanism as nationalistic distortion, which he believed restricted America's musical development:

Just as opera satisfies our hunger, dulls our initiative, and keeps us from developing our own resources, so I think many travelling concerts ... given by our two or three orchestras, make individual effort on the part of our cities seem unnecessary. New York, for example, with its huge population, is musically inferior to such a small German town as Wiesbaden (with its two permanent orchestras)... This does harm to the weaker without helping the stronger one to any fixed value. Added to this, an American concert is a direct bid for leniency on the part of the public which I hardly need say is immediately recognized by it... We crave comparison with the best in art, not only with the best in America.¹⁹

Moreover, he denied having his music in the programs of some of the concerts that were prepared under titles such as "American music." MacDowell always refused the requests to be a part of such "special" concerts in which he was called to perform or to contribute his music— "I am not in sympathy with American concerts."²⁰ He explained the reason of his negative response toward the issue to his colleague William Mason:

I wish to protect against the lumping together of American composers. By giving such a concert you tacitly admit that we are too inferior to stand comparison with the composers of Europe. Unless we are worthy of being put in programs with other composers, to stand or fall, leave us alone.²¹

His fervent reaction to defining the American music was partially due to the ceaseless demands from the concert organisers in the music business for MacDowell's appearance because he was surely the favoured composer in the list of great composers in the

¹⁸ Edward MacDowell to T. P. Currier, Paris, 1895, quoted in Currier, *Musical Quarterly*, January 1915.

¹⁹ Draft Letter, April 23, 1899, unsent, Columbia University, Box 34. (MacDowell most of his letters during his Columbia years, 1896-1904, with a carbon copy in a letter book; many of the carbons have no address of date.)

²⁰ Edward MacDowell to editor, *Musical Courier*, Box 29, Folder 8.

²¹ Edward MacDowell to William Mason, quoted by Daniel Gregory Mason, the latter's son, in an address at the MacDowell Exposition, Columbia University, 1938.

country.²² Nevertheless, MacDowell firmly believed that “Protection in music is retrograde...To attempt to nationalise music is to narrow it.”²³

Thus, for MacDowell, finding his own identity as a composer or musician with his American origin and largely European training was a continuous struggle against both society and himself. Grieg, who had a firm belief in his own musical tradition and who provided the kind of support MacDowell needed, influenced MacDowell from two perspectives which are also the important musical foundations for Grieg himself: one with the adoption of European Romanticism, particularly Germanic; and the other with the identity of the own nationalism. Despite the connection between both German Romantic and national legacies in Grieg’s musical world, he distinguished his Nordic musical traditions from the Germanic ones, which were overbearing over the European countries with Wagnerianism— “these Gentleman Wagnerians [unnamed] are apes and in addition stupid and arrogant apes.” Cautious about the Wagnerian trend in Europe, Grieg wrote MacDowell with his sincere concern for American music and musicians. Grieg wrote of how MacDowell’s music reveals enthusiasm for Wagner, which Grieg agreed was also true of himself but he reminded MacDowell saying, “you are no so-called Wagnerian.”²⁴ It is true that MacDowell’s piano sonatas and much of his thematic orchestral music apply the exposition and interweaving of *leitmotifs* (leading motives)²⁵; however, Grieg also encouraged MacDowell with a thoughtful compliment on MacDowell’s sensitive, original artistic ability to blend poetry and music — “obliging the musician’s fantasy to visit the same place where the poet had lived.”— and Grieg voiced his hope that the American musical public could acknowledge MacDowell’s “earnest

²² Levy, *Edward MacDowell: An American Master*, p. 110.

²³ Edward MacDowell, undated, unspecified addressee, Box 29, Folder 22.

²⁴ Levy, *Edward MacDowell: An American Master*, p. 168.

²⁵ Arnold Whittall, “Leitmotif,” in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol. 14, pp.527-530. Also see, Barry Millington, “(Wilhelm) Richard Wagner,” in: *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 29 vols, ed. by Stanley Sadie (New York: Macmillan, 2001), vol.26, pp.931-971.

purpose and masterly craft.”²⁶ In his own terms, MacDowell’s definition of musical nationalism concerned only the character of the music, not its place of composition or the composer’s citizenship:

I am convinced that the giving of so-called American concerts has done more harm to the cause of productive work in music here than anything else.²⁷

When he gave a lecture at Columbia University, MacDowell also said:

National music has no place in art, for its characteristics may be duplicated by anyone who takes the fancy to do so. On the other hand, the vital element of music — personality — stands alone.... Music that can be made by recipe is not music, but ‘tailoring.’²⁸

Confirming his philosophy in music, the final movement of his *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, Op.15 clearly reveals MacDowell’s respect and admiration toward Grieg through the musical features MacDowell attempted. Though the comparison between their respective concertos differs from that of Schumann and Grieg, it is easy to recognise MacDowell’s adoption of musical ideas from his hero Grieg. When one listens to the third movement of MacDowell’s first concerto, the familiar opening is easily reminiscent of the introduction of Grieg’s A-Minor concerto. Like Grieg, MacDowell employs the timpani to prepare for the solo piano. The timpani roll from *pianissimo* and then *crescendo* to *forte* over the first four measures, which are followed by the piano solo in *fortissimo* at measure 5 with the running-sound figures. Interestingly, just as Grieg created new ideas in the concerto even while modelling Schumann’s concerto,

²⁶ Grieg to MacDowell, June 30, 1900, Box 30, Folder 48, trans. for Mrs. MacDowell by August Borosini, 1955.

²⁷ Edward MacDowell to Mrs. Uhl, April 23, 1899, Box 29, Folder 16.

²⁸ From MacDowell’s lectures at Columbia University, quoted in Gilman, MacDowell, pp.17-18.

MacDowell also differentiates his own ideas from Grieg's by using the running passage whose range spans from the low to high register first, then moves all the way down back to the low register again. As a result, the overall musical mood MacDowell crafted in the opening of this movement shares much of Grieg's musical traits yet he maintains his own identity. MacDowell also fashioned the introduction further in the same way two more times at measures 6 and 11. Example 2 shows MacDowell's opening of the third movement.

Presto ♩ = 160.

I. Flauti.

II.

I. Oboi.

II.

I. Clarinetti in A.

II.

I. Fagotti

II.

Torni I. II. in F.

Trombe I. II. in F.

Timpani in E. A.

Presto ♩ = 160.

Piano.

Violino I.

Violino II.

Viola.

Violoncello.

Contra-Basso.

Timp.

a tempo

pp

a tempo

Piana

Strepito.

Fv.

Ob.

Cl.

Fg.

Cor.

Tr.

Timp.

Piano

I.

Viol.

II.

Vla.

Vol.

C.-B.

The image shows a page of a musical score for Edward MacDowell's Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, measures 1-15. The score is arranged in systems. The top system features the Piano and Harp parts. The Piano part is marked *mp* and *Strepito*. The Harp part is marked *pp*. The score is marked *a tempo* at the beginning and end. The middle system includes woodwinds (Flute, Oboe, Clarinet, Bassoon, Cor), brass (Trumpet, Trombone, Timpani), and strings (Violin I and II, Viola, Violoncello, Contrabass). The Piano part in this system is marked *A piacere ff* and *cresc. e stretto*. The bottom system features the Harp part, marked *martellato* and *quasi trillo*.

Example 2

Edward MacDowell, Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, mm.1-15

The chromaticism Grieg enjoyed in his concerto is an important tool in MacDowell's music as well. For example, in measures 41-42 and 139-140 Grieg uses

chromatic descending lines accompanied only by strings, whose job is to play very few notes in *pizzicato*. Example 3-(a) and (b) show the specific measures from Grieg's Piano Concerto.

The image displays a musical score for Example 3-(a) from Edvard Grieg's Piano Concerto, measures 41-42. The score is divided into two systems. The top system shows the piano part (treble and bass clefs) and the string parts (five staves). The piano part features a chromatic descending line in the right hand, starting with a forte (*f*) dynamic and marked *dimin.* (diminuendo), transitioning to a pianissimo (*pp*) dynamic and marked *calando* (ritardando). The string parts are marked *pizz.* (pizzicato) and *fz* (forzando), with a *calando* marking. The score includes various musical notations such as dynamics, articulation marks (accents), and performance instructions.

Example 3-(a)

Edvard Grieg, First Movement, mm. 41-42

The image shows a musical score for Edvard Grieg's First Movement, measures 139-140. The score is in 3/4 time and features a piano solo with chromatic lines and a staccato string accompaniment. The piano part starts with a forte (f) dynamic, then diminishes (dim.), and ends with a pianissimo (pp) dynamic. The string accompaniment is marked pizz. (pizzicato) and f_z (forzando). The tempo marking 'calando' is present throughout. The score is divided into two systems, with the second system containing six staves for the strings.

Example 3-(b)

Edvard Grieg, First Movement, mm. 139-140

The third movement of MacDowell's concerto makes use of a similar idea: for example, in measures from 205 to 206 or from 215 to 218, MacDowell also minimises the accompaniment mostly concentrated on the staccato strings while the piano solo shows off the brilliant chromatic lines. MacDowell seems to prefer using chromatic lines in both directions — up and down — in contrast to Grieg, who moves on to a new musical passage or ideas after finishing a chromatic line toward one direction — either up or down. Example 4-(a) and (b) show the specific measures from MacDowell's Piano Concerto.

The image displays three systems of musical notation for piano. The first system consists of five staves. The top staff features a series of chords in the right hand, while the lower staves show rhythmic accompaniment in the left hand. A dynamic marking of *ff* is present in the fourth staff. The second system features a dense texture of chords in both hands, with a fermata over the first measure of the right hand. The third system consists of five staves, each beginning with a dynamic marking of *f*, showing rhythmic accompaniment in the left hand.

Example 4-(a)

Edward MacDowell, Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, mm. 205-206

Example 4-(b)

Edward MacDowell, Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, mm. 215-218

Another musical feature Grieg favoured is the use of the long pedal point, while the right hand of the solo piano plays the lyrical, *cantabile* melodic lines. For example, measures 43 to 47 have the pedal point on G assigned to the left hand of the piano and to the bass, while the piano starts out the beautiful melody in *piano*. Later in measures 141 to 146, the left hand of the piano and the bass strings play the pedal point on E with the right hand on the melodic line. Example 5-(a) and (b) show the specific measures from Grieg's Piano Concerto.

43

B

Ob. *a tempo* I. *p dolce* *cresc.* *stretto*

Pfte. *a tempo cantabile* *p* *mf* *stretto*

I. *a tempo* *stretto* *cresc.*

VI. *pp a tempo arco* *stretto* *cresc.*

II. *pp a tempo arco* *stretto* *cresc.*

Vla. *pp a tempo arco* *stretto* *cresc.*

Vcllo. *pp a tempo* *stretto* *cresc.*

B. *pp a tempo* *stretto* *cresc.*

B *pp*

46 I.

Fl. *mf cresc.* *f dim. e ritardando*

Ob. *f dim. e ritardando*

Clar. in A I. *mf cresc.* *f dim. e ritardando*

Fag. I. *mf cresc.* *f dim. e ritardando*

Cor. in E I II *f dim. e ritardando*

Pfte *f molto cresc.* *ff* *poco rit.*

I VI. *f*

II VI. *f*

Vla. *f*

Vcello *f*

B *f*

Example 5-(a)

Grieg, First Movement, mm. 43-47

141 **F**
a tempo
 Ob. *p dolce* *cresc.*
 Pfte *p cantabile* *a tempo* *cresc.*
 I. *pp arco a tempo* *a tempo* *cresc.*
 II. *pp arco a tempo* *a tempo* *cresc.*
 Vla. *pp arco a tempo* *a tempo* *cresc.*
 Vcello *pp a tempo* *a tempo* *cresc.*
 B. *pp a tempo* *a tempo* *cresc.*

144 **F**
 Fl. *mf* *f dim. e ritardando* *p*
 Ob. *mf* *f dim. e ritardando* *p*
 Clar. in A *mf* *f dim. e ritardando* *p*
 Fag. *mf* *f dim. e ritardando* *p*
 Cor. in E I II *mf* *f dim. e ritardando* *p*
 Pfte *f* *molto cresc.* *ff* *poco rit.* *p*
 I. *f* *molto rit.*
 VI. *f* *molto rit.*
 Vla. *f* *molto rit.*
 Vcello *f* *div. molto rit.*
 B. *f* *molto rit.* *p*

Example 5-(b)

Grieg, First Movement, mm. 141-146

MacDowell displays a similar style in his movement where he places the long pedal point, but his originality for the piano part carries him in a different direction from Grieg. Instead of writing the lyrical melodic lines as Grieg does, MacDowell employs very strong accents and musical features such as *marcatissimo* and *maestoso* on the piano, which usually produce a *forte* sound. Measures 55 to 65 has the pedal point on E presented by the bass and the timpani instead of using the left hand of the piano; later in measures 243 to 267 the pedal point is on F for a prolonged period but is still performed by the bass and the timpani while the piano plays the arpeggiated harmonies with animated spirit in triple *forte*. Example 6-(a) and (b) show the specific measures from MacDowell's Piano Concerto in A minor.

The image displays three systems of musical notation for MacDowell's Piano Concerto in A minor. The first system (measures 55-65) features a long pedal point on E in the bass and timpani, with the piano part playing arpeggiated harmonies. The second system (measures 66-70) shows the piano part with arpeggiated harmonies and the instruction 'marcatissimo'. The third system (measures 71-75) shows the piano part with arpeggiated harmonies and the instruction 'arco'.

The image shows a page of a musical score, page 31, featuring various instruments. The score is written in a key signature of one flat (B-flat) and a common time signature (C). The instruments and their parts are as follows:

- Fl. (Flute):** Rests for most of the page, with a final measure containing a whole note chord.
- Ob. (Oboe):** Plays a melodic line with a long slur across the first four measures, followed by a final measure with a whole note chord.
- Cl. (Clarinet):** Plays a melodic line with a long slur across the first four measures, followed by a final measure with a whole note chord.
- Fg. (Bassoon):** Rests for most of the page, with a final measure containing a whole note chord.
- Cor. (Cor Anglais):** Rests throughout the page.
- Tr. (Trumpet):** Rests throughout the page.
- Timp. (Trombone):** Plays a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes with a trill (tr) marking in the first measure.
- Piano:** Plays a complex, fast-moving accompaniment with many sixteenth and thirty-second notes.
- Viol. I (Violin I):** Plays a series of chords, primarily triads and dyads, with a crescendo leading to the final measure.
- Viol. II (Violin II):** Plays a series of chords, primarily triads and dyads, with a crescendo leading to the final measure.
- Vla. (Viola):** Plays a series of chords, primarily triads and dyads, with a crescendo leading to the final measure.
- Vcl. (Violoncello):** Plays a melodic line with a long slur across the first four measures, followed by a final measure with a whole note chord.
- C.B. (Contrabass):** Plays a melodic line with a long slur across the first four measures, followed by a final measure with a whole note chord.

Musical score for Example 6-(a) from Edward MacDowell's Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement. The score is arranged in a system with the following parts and dynamics:

- Flute (Fl.):** *f*
- Oboe (Ob.):** *f*
- Clarinet (Cl.):** *f*
- Bassoon (Fg.):** *f*
- Cor Anglais (Cor.):** *mf*
- Trumpet (Tr.):** -
- Piano (Piano.):** *quasi trillo*
- Violin I (Viol. I.):** *f*
- Violin II (Viol. II.):** *f*
- Viola (Vla.):** *f*
- Violoncello (Vcl.):** *f*
- Contrabass (C.-B.):** *f*

Example 6-(a)

Edward MacDowell, Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, mm. 55-65

M. *Maestoso* ♩ = 138.

The first system of the musical score consists of six staves. The top two staves are marked with *ff* and feature long, horizontal notes with ties. The third and fourth staves are also marked with *ff* and contain similar long notes. The fifth staff is marked *Solo.* and contains a long note with a trill-like ornament. The bottom staff is marked *tr* and contains a trill. The tempo is *Maestoso* with a quarter note equal to 138 beats per minute.

M. *Maestoso* ♩ = 138.

The second system of the musical score consists of six staves. The top two staves are marked with *fff* and feature a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes. The bottom four staves are marked with *ff* and feature a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes. The tempo is *Maestoso* with a quarter note equal to 138 beats per minute.

Fl.
Ob.
Cl.
Fg.
Cor.
Tr.
Temp.
Piano
Viol. I.
Viol. II.
Vla.
Vcl.
C.B.

ff
ff
ff
ff
ff
pp 3
pp 3
pp 3
5 1
1 5
12
6
6
12
12
12
12
12
6
6
12
12
ff
ff
ff
ff
ff
ff

Fl.
 Ob.
 Cl.
 Fg.
 Cor.
 Tr.
 Timp.
 Piano.
 I. Viol.
 II. Viol.
 Vla.
 Vcl.
 C.B.

The score is written for a full symphony orchestra. The woodwind section (Flute, Oboe, Clarinet, Bassoon, Horn, Trumpet) and Timpani parts show a gradual increase in volume, marked with *cresc.*. The Piano part features intricate rhythmic patterns, including triplets and sixteenth-note runs. The string section (Violin I, Violin II, Viola, Violoncello, Contrabass) provides harmonic support, with the Violoncello part marked *divisi* and *p*. The score includes dynamic markings such as *p* (piano) and *cresc.* (crescendo).

This page of a musical score includes the following parts and markings:

- Flute (Fl.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and long notes.
- Oboe (Ob.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and long notes.
- Clarinet (Cl.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and long notes.
- Bassoon (Fg.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and long notes.
- Cor Anglais (Cor.):** Part with long notes.
- Trumpet (Tr.):** Part with *Solo* marking and long notes.
- Timpani (Timp.):** Part with rhythmic patterns.
- Piano:** Part with *fff* dynamic and a continuous sixteenth-note accompaniment.
- Violins (Viol.):** Parts I and II with *ff* dynamic and notes marked with *12*.
- Viola (Vla.):** Part with *div 12* marking, *ff* dynamic, and notes marked with *12*.
- Violoncello (Vcl.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and notes marked with *12*.
- Double Bass (C.B.):** Part with *ff* dynamic and notes marked with *12*.

The image shows a page of a musical score for Example 6-(b). The score is arranged in a system with multiple staves. The instruments listed on the left are: Fl. (Flute), Ob. (Oboe), Cl. (Clarinet), Fg. (Bassoon), Cor. (Cor Anglais), Tr. (Trumpet), Timp. (Tympani), Piano, Viol. I (Violin I), Viol. II (Violin II), Vla. (Viola), Vcl. (Violoncello), and C.-B. (Contrabass). The music is written in A minor and 3/4 time. The score consists of three measures. The first two measures show sustained notes for the woodwinds and strings, with a trill in the Timp. part. The third measure features a triplet of eighth notes in the Fg., Cor., and Timp. parts, while the other instruments play sustained notes. The Piano part has a rhythmic accompaniment of eighth notes. The Violin and Viola parts have a melodic line with a fermata over the final note. The Violoncello and Contrabass parts have a bass line with a fermata over the final note. The score is marked with dynamics such as *ff* and *fz*.

Example 6-(b)

Edward MacDowell, Piano Concerto in A minor, Third Movement, mm. 265-267

* * *

Edvard Grieg and Edward MacDowell, despite cultural and national differences, maintained mutual respect and admiration, exchanging not only personal correspondence but also the musical philosophy deeply rooted in their lives. MacDowell's special devotion to this Norwegian master is purposely presented in his *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, Op.15, particularly in the third movement where similar musical ideas from Grieg's *Piano Concerto in A-Minor*, Op.16 surface. Both composers wrote these concertos when they were young men with the passion and courage to start their musical career seriously after significant years of musical training in a foreign country, Germany. These remarkably timeless compositions brought fame, and they still remain important repertoires in the piano concerto genre. Although Germanic Romanticism initially inspired both, Grieg and MacDowell never lost their identities. Although their approaches to nationalism differed as MacDowell embraced music as a global language while Grieg was clear about his Nordic tradition as an individual art, their respective countries were always in the centre of their heart. Two composers from two different countries, which means more than their mere differences between language, culture, and musical roots, maintained their friendship until the end of their lives. Grieg's heartfelt advice to a young MacDowell on maintaining identity certainly shaped the musical philosophy of this composer and many of his compositions following his first piano concerto placed MacDowell as America's most original composer.